R E P O R T R E S U M E S

ED 020 798 PS 001 010

GRADE EQUIVALENT COMPARISONS BETWEEN DISADVANTAGED NEGRO URBAN CHILDREN WITH AND WITHOUT KINDERGARTEN EXPERIENCE WHEN TAUGHT TO READ BY SEVERAL METHODS.

BY- MORRISON, COLEMAN HARRIS, ALBERT J.
CITY UNIV. OF NEW YORK, DIV. OF TEACHER EDUCATION

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.25 HC-$0.24 4P.

DESCRIPTORS- CULTURALLY DISADVANTAGED, *DISADVANTAGED YOUTH, *BEGINNING READING, READING ABILITY, READING ACHIEVEMENT, *READING INSTRUCTION, *READING PROGRAMS, *LANGUAGE EXPERIENCE APPROACH, PRIMARY GRADES, COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS, METROPOLITAN ACHIEVEMENT TEST, CRAFT PROJECT,

THIS STUDY IS PART OF THE CRAFT READING PROJECT OF THE NEW YORK PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM WHICH IS INVESTIGATING THE READING PROGRESS OF DISADVANTAGED URBAN NEGRO CHILDREN. IN THE PRESENT STUDY, CHILDREN IN GRADES ONE, TWO, AND THREE, WITH AND WITHOUT PREVIOUS KINDERGARTEN EXPERIENCE, WERE TAUGHT READING BY TWO BASIC METHODS, EACH DIVIDED INTO TWO SUBMETHODS. ONE BASIC METHOD WAS THE SKILLS-CENTERED METHOD, DIVIDED INTO (1) A BASAL READER METHOD, WHICH USED CONVENTIONAL BASAL READERS, AND (2) A PHONOVISUAL METHOD, WHICH COMBINED USE OF BASAL READERS WITH A PHONOVISUAL SYSTEM OF TEACHING. THE SECOND BASIC METHOD WAS THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE METHOD, WHICH DEVELOPED READING MATERIALS FROM THE EXPERIENCES AND VERBALIZATIONS OF THE CHILDREN, GRADUALLY MOVING INTO INDIVIDUALIZED READING. THE RESULTS OF THIS STUDY ARE BASED ON METROPOLITAN ACHIEVEMENT TEST SCORES OF THE PUPILS OBTAINED IN GRADES TWO AND THREE OF THE ORIGINAL CRAFT PROJECT AND IN GRADE TWO OF A REPLICATION STUDY. THE PUPILS WITH KINDERGARTEN EXPERIENCE GENERALLY SCORED HIGHER THAN NONKINDERGARTEN PUPILS, ALTHOUGH SIGNIFICANT RESULTS, ON AN INDIVIDUAL TEACHING METHOD BASIS, OCCURRED CONSISTENTLY ONLY FOR THE REGULAR LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE METHOD. ON THE BASIS OF THE TWO BASIC METHODS OF TEACHING READING, AGAIN, ONLY THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE METHOD SCORES WERE CONSISTENTLY SIGNIFICANT. (WD)

U. S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

ED020798

Grade Equivalent Comparisons between Disadvantaged Negro Urban Children with and without Kindergarten Experience when Taught to Read by Several Methods

Coleman Morrison Albert J. Harris
The City University of New York

Background Information for Tables

The study being reported is part of a larger one called the CRAFT Project (Comparing Reading Approaches in First-Grade Teaching with Disadvantaged Children) which investigated progress in reading of disadvantaged urban Negro children in the New York public schools from the beginning of the first grade through the third grade in an original study, and through second grade in a Replication study. Children were taught to read by two basic approaches, Skills-Centered and Language-Experience. The Skills-Centered Approach included two methods, a Basal Reader Method, using conventional basal readers, and a Phonovisual Method, which combined use of basal readers with the Phonovisual system of teaching and identificational skills. The Language-Experience Approach developed reading materials from the experiences and verbalizations of the children and gradually moved into individualized reading. It had two variants, a regular Language-Experience Method, and a Language-Experience Audio-Visual Method, in which several kinds of audio-visual supplementation were provided.

Results for the study being reported are based on tests taken by the kindergarten and non-kindergarten population at the end of Grade 2 in both the Original and Replication Studies, and in Grade 3 of the Original Study. Only scores for children who had attended kindergarten for a minimum of 101 days and a maximum of 200 days, and for those children with no kindergarten experience were used.

The population N's include the follcwing:

Grade 2 (Original)	
with kindergarten	416
without kindergarten	168
Grade 2 (Replication)	
with kindergarten	226
without kindergarten	55
Grade 3 (Original)	
with kindergarten	329
without kindergarten	114

Means and Standard Deviations were derived from test results. Means were then converted into grade equivalent scores and t values were made for comparisons between children with and without kindergarten experience. These results are reported in Tables 1-3.

The kindergarten program in New York City is comparable to that found in most urban school systems throughout the country. The curriculum stresses social and emotional development of the children with some corresponding effort to develop intellectual abilities. In the field of Language Arts children share personal experiences, listen to stories read by the teachers, and utilize available resources to expand their vocabularies, improve oral experiences, and share ideas. No formal instruction in reading is provided.

Results of the study can be found in accompanying Tables.

PS001010

Table 1

Grade Equivalent Comparisons between Children With and Without Kindergarten Experience, Grade 2

Method and Approach	MAT[a] Word Knowledge		MAT Reading	
	With	Without	With	Without
Skills-Centered Approach				
Basal Reader	2.6*	2.4	2.3*	2.1
Phonovisual	2.5	2.4	2.3	2.3
Total	2.6	2.4	2.3	2.3
Language-Experience Approach				
Language Experience	2.5*	2.2	2.4*	2.1
Language Experience Audio-Visual	2.4	2.4	2.3*	2.0
Total	2.4*	2.3	2.4*	2.1
All Methods	2.5**	2.4	2.4**	2.2

[a] Metropolitan Achievement Test

* $P < .05$

** $P < .01$

Table 2

Grade Equivalent Comparisons between Children With and Without Kindergarten Experience, Replication 2

Method and Approach	MAT[a] Word Knowledge		MAT Reading	
	With	Without	With	Without
Skills-Centered Approach				
Basal Reader	2.7	2.2	2.7	2.3
Phonovisual	2.6	2.4	2.7	2.3
Total[b]	2.7**	2.3	2.7**	2.3
Language-Experience Approach				
Language Experience	2.7	2.5	2.6	2.6
Language Experience Audio-Visual	2.4	2.1	2.3	2.3
Total	2.5**	2.2	2.5	2.3
All Methods	2.6**	2.2	2.6**	2.3

[a] Metropolitan Achievement Test

[b] *t* tests were computed only for the two Approaches and Total, due to the small N's for some methods

** $p < .01$

Table 3

Grade Equivalent Comparisons between Children With and Without Kindergarten Experience, Grade 3

Method and Approach	MAT[a] Word Knowledge		MAT Reading	
	With	Without	With	Without
Skills-Centered Approach				
Basal Reader	3.3	3.2	3.4	3.3
Phonovisual	3.3	3.7	3.4	3.5
Total	3.3	3.4	3.4	3.4
Language-Experience Approach				
Language Experience	3.6**	3.1	3.7**	3.3
Language Experience Audio-Visual	3.6	3.4	3.4	3.4
Total	3.6**	3.1	3.6**	3.3
All Methods	3.4	3.3	3.5*	3.4

[a] Metropolitan Achievement Test

* $P < .05$

** $P < .01$

PS
from GERAL

Table 3

Grade Equivalent Comparisons between Children With and Without Kindergarten Experience, Grade 3

Method and Approach	MAT* Word Knowledge		MAT* Reading	
	With	Without	With	Without
Skills-Centered Approach				
Basal-Reader	3.3	3.2	3.4	3.3
Phonovisual	3.3	3.7	3.4	3.5
Total	3.3	3.4	3.4	3.4
Language-Experience Approach				
Language Experience	3.6**	3.1	3.7**	3.3
Language Experience Audio-Visual	3.6	3.4	3.4	3.4
Total	3.6**	3.4	3.6**	3.3
All Methods	3.4	3.3	3.5*	3.4

* Metropolitan Achievement Test

* $p < .05$

** $p < .01$